RAJYA SABHA

Monday, the 13th July, 1992/22 Asadha, 1914 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock **The Deputy Chairman** in the Chair

MEMBERS SWORN

1. Shrimati Ila Panda (Orissa).
2. Shri Som Pal (Uttar Pradesh).

Re. DEMAND FOR STATEMENT BY HOME MINISTER ON HIS RECENT VISIT TO AYODHYA

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Question .... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh) : The Home Minister has gone to Ayodhya .... (*Interruptions*). We would like to know from the Government whether the Home Minister is making a statement or not (*Interruptions*).

SOME HON. MEMBERS : Where is the Home Minister ? (*Interruptions*).

एक माननीय सदस्य : गृह मंत्री अपना बयान दें ।

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Is the Home Minister making any Statement ? (*Interruptions*). What is the reaction of the Government ? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra) : Madam, we want a statement today itself .... (*Interruptions*) .... The House should not adjourn without the Home Minister making a statement .... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just one minute .... (*Interruptions*) .... Let me inform you .... (*Interruptions*) .... जरा बैठिए, जीरो आवर शुरू नहीं हुआ है, जरा बैठिए ।

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम, गृह मंत्री से बयान दिलवाइए .... (**व्यवधान**) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have received two notices .... (*Interruptions*) .... Just a minute, please .... (*Interruptions*) ....

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया (बिहार) : मैडम गृह मंत्री आश्वासन देते रहे कि वह हैं सदन को आश्वासन करायेंगे .... (**व्यवधान**) ...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : Before the House adjourns at 12 O'clock, the Home Minister should make a statement .... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me answer .... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Why is the Home Minister absconding .... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just one minute, please .... (*Interruptions*) .... अगर आप आपस में बात नहीं करेंगे तो आपकी मेरी बात सुनायी देगी ।

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : We want a statement from the Home Minister today .... (*Interruptions*) ....

श्री राम नरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, आपके माध्यम से हमारी यह मांग है कि गृह मंत्री जी .... (**व्यवधान**) ... सदन को आश्वासन कराएं ।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : महोदया, सदन को पिछले तीन दिनों से आश्वासन दिया जा रहा है कि गृह मंत्रीजी सदन में बयान देंगे ... (**व्यवधान**) ... अभी तक कोई ब्यान नहीं दिया गया है ।

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, I gave notice .... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Will you please listen to me .... (*Interruptions*) ... अफजल साहब, ईशदत्त जी, मुझे पहले एक बात हाउस को इनफॉर्म करने दीजिए, फिर आप बोलिए।

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम, उनको यहां होना चाहिए।

SHRI ISH DUTT YADAV (Uttar Pradesh) : The Home Minister should be here .... (*Interruptions*) ....

उपसभापति : उन्हें यहां होना चाहिए, पर आप मेरी बात सुनिए।

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : मैडम, गृह मंत्री को यहां सदन में आकर बयान देना चाहिए।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please listen to me .... (*Interruptions*) .... I have received two notices today .... (*Interruptions*) .... It was decided that since our Secretariat is involved with the elections of the President and due to paucity of staff a decision was taken informally. It was decided that after the Question Hour we should adjourn the House. Now, I have received two notices, one from Shri Subramanian Swamy and one from Mr. Jaipal Reddy for suspension of Question Hour .... (*Interruptions*) ....

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : It is an urgent matter. The whole country is worried ... (*Interruptions*) ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me find out where the Home Minister is .... (*Interruptions*) ....

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra) : There was a demand from all the parties ... (*Interruptions*). You direct the Government to make a statement .... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : The Government appears to be paralytic. For the last three or four days, they have not been doing anything and the inaction of the Government is most reprehensible .... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal) : Where is Mr. Chavan ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am finding out .... (*Interruptions*). Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, I will find out .... (*Interruptions*).

श्री सुरेश कलमाडी : चार दिन हो गए मैडम चार दिन से काम चालू है ... (**व्यवधान**) होम मिनिस्टर स्टेटमेंट नहीं दे रहे हैं ... (**व्यवधान**) ...

The House should not be adjourned till the Home Minister makes his statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Subramanian Swamy has given a letter. Let him say something ... (*Interruptions*).

श्री राम नरेश यादव : गृह मंत्री जी मौके पर होकर भी आए हैं ... (**व्यवधान**) ...

उपसभापति : आप लोग बैठें तो क्वेश्चन शुरू कर सकते हैं ... (**व्यवधान**) ... प्लीज हीयर मी (**व्यवधान**) ...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : My only request to you is that the House shall not adjourn till the Home Minister makes a statement. It is a very important issue and we want an assurance from the Chair that the Home Minister will make a statement .... (*Interruptions*).

डा० अब्दुल अहमद (राजस्थान) : हम लोग यह मांग कर रहे हैं कि गृह मंत्री यहां वक्तव्य दें लेकिन पांच दिन इस बात को हो गए अभी तक गृह मंत्री का कोई वक्तव्य नहीं आया है। यह नया प्रस्ताव नहीं है। जब तक गृह मंत्री वक्तव्य नहीं देंगे तब तक हाउस नहीं चलेगा ... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra) : Since the House is going to adjourn at 12 O'clock by what time is the Home Minister going to make his statement .... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will not permit such a thing .... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : One minute ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing you .... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL : *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am sorry, Mr. Afzal. I will not permit any such comment about the Prime Minister to go on record .... (*Interruptions*). I don't allow it to go on record. I won't permit any remark against the Prime Minister .... (*Interruptions*). No, I will not permit any such remark against the Prime Minister .... (*Interruptions*). It will not go on record. It will not be reported in the Press. I am trying to bring an order in the House. Mr. Afzal, I know that you are agitated. But that does not mean that you can pass any comment against the Prime Minister of this country. I will not permit it .... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : The House should not be adjourned till the Home Minister makes a statement. I want a categorical assurance from you that the House will not be adjourned till the Home Minister makes a statement .... (*Interruptions*). The Home Minister must give a statement.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह (बिहार) : मैडम, एक बात की तरफ ध्यान देना चाहिए । जब पूरा देश इस बात को जानता है कि अयोध्या का मामला ... (**व्यवधान**) वह स्वयं अपनी ओर से क्या तथ्य है इस बात को बताएं ... (**व्यवधान**) मैं समझता हूं कि लीडर ऑफ दि हाऊस को सरकार की ओर से बयान देना चाहिए ... (**व्यवधान**) वे अभी आकर सदन में बयान दें कि क्यों इस तरह की स्थिति पैदा हो रही है आखिर ... (**व्यवधान**) हमारी मांग यह है कि वह सदन में बयान दें ... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV : Madam Deputy Chairman, this is a very serious matter .... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : The Home Minister has made a commitment that he will make a statement in the House. Therefore, the House should not be adjourned till a statement is made .... (*Interruptions*). It is the commitment of the Home Minister that he will make a statement ....

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : अभी तक गृह मंत्री का कोई बयान नहीं आया है । गृह मंत्री जी को बुलाया जाए और वह तो स्वयं अयोध्या जाकर, घूमकर वापस आए हैं ... (**व्यवधान**) वह सारे तथ्य सदन को बताएं ... (**व्यवधान**) सदन को बताने की जरूरत है ... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : A statement is being made in the Lok Sabha. (*Interruptions*).

The Rajya Sabha also has a right to ask the Home Minister .... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAGESH DESAI : What is this ? .... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : In the Rajya Sabha clarifications can be asked .... (*Interruptions*). It is very important that a statement is made on the floor of this House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Dipen Ghosh has a suggestion. वह कुछ मशविरा देने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं ।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal) : It has appeared in the Press about some of his comments and today the House is meeting .... (*Interruptions*) .... after the Home Minister has visited Ayodhya and made his inspection. So, the House is entitled to know what the Home Minister has to say and what the Government has to say about the situation in Ayodhya. The Rajya Sabha cannot be taken for a ride .... (*Interruptions*) ....

*Not recorded.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : महोदया, हम इसमें हर तरह का सहयोग देने के लिए तैयार हैं लेकिन आपकी ओर से निर्देश आना चाहिए कि गृह मंत्री एक घंटे के अंदर सदन में बयान दें ... **(व्यवधान)**

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : I would like to explain about my notice .... (*Interruptions*) ....

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : महोदया, आप स्वयं इस बात को जानती है कि एक घंटे के बाद सदन की कार्यवाही नहीं होगी। तो एक घंटे के बाद तो हाउस को वैसे ही ऐडजार्न होना है। इसलिए आपकी रूलिंग आनी चाहिए कि ... **(व्यवधान)**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. Mr. Subramanian Swamy has given notice .... (*Interruptions*) ....

श्री नरेश कुमार यादव : गृह मंत्री कहां हैं ?

उपसभापति : मैं मालूम करा रही हूं ... **(व्यवधान)** I am trying to find out where he is. He might be in the Lok Sabha. I do not know .... (*Interruptions*) ....

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : गृह मंत्री कहां हैं उनको बुलाया जाए। वह सदन को सारी स्थिति से अवगत कराएं ... **(व्यवधान)**

श्री राम नरेश यादव : गृह मंत्री स्वयं मौके पर होकर आए हैं लेकिन अभी तक कोई स्टेटमेंट नहीं आया है। इसलिए आपके माध्यम से यह अनुरोध है कि सदन को विश्वास में लेकर सारी स्थिति से अवगत कराया जाए .... **(व्यवधान)**

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : You can give him a direction .... (*Interruptions*) .... You can issue a direction to the Home Minister to come to the House .... (*Interruptions*) ....

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : Madam, I want a commitment from you that the House will not be adjourned .... (*Interruptions*) .... till the Home Minister makes a statement here .... (*Interruptions*) .... because it is the right of the Members of the Rajya Sabha. He cannot make a statement only in the Lok Sabha. We have to seek clarifications .... (*Interruptions*) .... This is a very important issue. Please summon the Home Minister .... (*Interruptions*) ....

श्री राम नरेश यादव : आज सदन उठने से पहले गृह मंत्री को बयान देना चाहिए ... **(व्यवधान)**

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar) Madam, I am surprised at the way the Government is functioning .... (*Interruptions*) .... I am very surprised at the way the Government is functioning. This House has been agitated on this question and this House had been adjourned ... (*Interruptions*) .... After two days we are meeting and the Government is aware of the mood of the House. Yet, after the weekend, there is nobody from the Government side to respond and say as to what exactly the Government is doing about it. This is most shameful .... (*Interruptions*) .... It is very shameful .... (*Interruptions*) .... There is nobody who can stand up and tell us what they are doing about it .... (*Interruptions*) ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have received two notices for suspending the Question Hour .... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : The Home Minister may be traced. Just as he said the other day about the Chief Minister, today he is traceless .... (*Interruptions*) ... There are senior Ministers sitting here. Let there be somebody. We are interested in the business of the House being carried on. We are not interested in stalling the proceedings. We want to discuss it. We want to know what action the Government has taken and somebody should respond .. (*Interruptions*) ....

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB) : Madam, I want to say something .... (*Interruptions*) ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, please .... (*Interruptions*) .... Mr. Jacob wants to say something .... (*Interruptions*) ....

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI (Madhya Pradesh) : Kindly adjourn the House .... (*Interruptions*) ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, please .... (*Interruptions*) .... Let the Minister of State for Home Affairs say something. He wants to say something .... (*Interruptions*) ....

AN HON. MEMBER : Will he also go to Ayodhya ? .... (*Interruptions*) ....

SHRI M. M. JACOB : Madam, I stand before you in deference to the opinion expressed by Mr. Yashwant Sinha and several other Members who are present here who want to know what the view of the Government on this particular issue is .... (*Interruptions*) .... Madam, we discussed this during the last two days in the House and whenever we have discussed it, we have also expressed our concern and anxiety and the Home Minister himself visited the spot and has come back and everybody knows it .... (*Interruptions*) ....

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : But he went yesterday and not today .... (*Interruptions*) ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let him finish .... (*Interruptions*) .... Let him finish first .... (*Interruptions*) .... Let him finish his sentence, please .... (*Interruptions*) ....

SHRI M. M. JACOB : Madam, the Home Minister visited the spot yesterday and the senior officers of the Government of India .... (*Interruptions*) .... who accompanied the Home Minister are staying back at Ayodhya to make further studies on the various details and the .... (*Interruptions*) .... Home Minister has to come to the House .... (*Interruptions*) ....

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : Madam, the Home Minister has to come .... (*Interruptions*) ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, please .... (*Interruptions*) .... However agitated the Members may be, please let Mr. Jacob say something .... (*Interruptions*) .... Let him inform us fully. Then you can express your agitation as much as you like. But let him first say what he wants to say. He is trying to explain something, trying to inform the House. Please give him an opportunity. Thank you .... (*Interruptions*) ....

SHRI M. M. JACOB : Madam, the Home Minister has come back last night .... (*Interruptions*) .... The statement of the Home Minister is not yet ready. As soon as it is ready, I can assure you, he will come and make the statement in the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The statement of the Home Minister is not ready yet. This is what I hear.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : I request you not to adjourn the House now; you adjourn it after the statement is made ... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me run the House properly; I have two written notices ....

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : What about the statement ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : One notice is from Mr. Subraamnian Swamy and another from Mr. Jaipal Reddy. Let me hear them for one minute each and I will allow you also for one minute and then let us take a decision, because I have

to take a decision whether I have to suspend the Question Hour .... (*Interruptions*). I have identified Mr. Subramanian Swamy.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: What about the statement? Before you take up the next topic .... (*Interruptions*).

श्री मोहम्मद अफ़ज़ल उर्फ मीम अफ़ज़ल : मैडम, मैं ... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति : आप जरा पीछे जाइये। अफ़ज़ल साहब, आप जरा पीछे जाइये और अपनी कुर्सी पर विराजमान होइए। मैं आपको बोलने की इजाजत दूंगी।

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Before you go to the next topic, we would like to know the fate of the statement. Are you going to adjourn the House even before the statement is made today or will he make the statement tomorrow? Shri Jacob just said about the statement of the Home Minister. Are you giving the assurance that the statement will be made today?

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : हम होम मिनिस्टर के बयान की मांग नहीं करते हैं ... (**व्यवधान**)

श्री संघप्रिय गौतम (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम ... (**व्यवधान**) ...देश को बेचकर खा गए, ... (**व्यवधान**)

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : उत्तर प्रदेश सरकार से कहिए ... (**व्यवधान**) ... एक्शन होना चाहिए।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jacob has just said that the statement is not ready yet. He has just informed the House. What do you want?

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Please tell us what kind of a statement will be ready. Let the House reassemble when the statement is ready. We are prepared to come back to the House when the statement is ready.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If that is the position, then most regretfully I suggest that the House be adjourned until the statement by the Home Minister is ready. You please adjourn the House now .... (*Interruptions*).

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : महोदया, ... (**व्यवधान**) होम मिनिस्टर साहब को वापस बुला लो। ... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: You may call us back at 4 or 5 O'clock when the statement is ready.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If the Government is not ready, then most regretfully I suggest that you adjourn the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not officially suspended the Question Hour, and I go according to rules. I have to permit Mr. Subramanian Swamy and Mr. Jaipal Reddy, and then I can take a decision.

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : मैडम, आपने सरकार को क्या डाइरेक्शन दिए हैं, आप उत्तर प्रदेश सरकार को बर्खास्त करें। इसके अलावा कोई विकल्प नहीं है। मैडम, आप पीठासीन अधिकारी की हैसियत से केन्द्र सरकार को डाइरेक्शन दीजिए कि वह उत्तर प्रदेश सरकार को बर्खास्त करे। हम होम मिनिस्टर का बयान चाहते हैं। देश की स्थिति दिनों-दिन बिगड़ती जा रही है और केन्द्र की सरकार उत्तर प्रदेश की सरकार से भयभीत है। ... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, you adjourn the House. You can do what you like. But we want an assurance that a statement .... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are not in a mood for the Question Hour. There is a notice to suspend the Question Hour. If we suspend the Question Hour, what are we going to discuss? What is the use? The statement is not ready. What is the use of sitting over here? I adjourn the House.